

# The Upliftment and Recognition of Matua Community: With Reference to Providing Them with Citizenship

**Ms. Archana Verma**

PhD. Scholar, Political Science Department, Amity University Kolkata

## Abstract

The term citizenship implies relationship between an individual and state wherein the individual is entitled protection from the state. The citizens enjoy all civil and political rights which are denied or extended partially to aliens or non-citizens. The articulation of citizenship in the constitution of India was a thorough process which encountered a lot of debates and arguments. There had been immense influence of colonialism along with the after effects of partition which led the constitution makers to frame a unified citizenship framework that would ensure inclusion of people as well as essential measures could be taken against illegal migrants. India since independence has been facing the problem of illegal migrants which has been a cause of grave concern for the safety and security of the country. There are communities in the country who face injustice politically, economically and socially especially because they have not been recognized as citizens of the country even though their ancestors belong to this land. The paper would focus on the idea of citizenship according to the constitution of India along with the rights and privileges conferred to them. It would also highlight the issue of illegal migration that is still a cause of grave concern for the security of the country along with necessary safeguards taken by the government to prevent it. The focus of the paper would be primarily on the Matua community, a marginalized community belonging to the border districts of West Bengal who since 1971 had been demanding rehabilitation and recognition in India by providing them citizenship. The community has been facing injustice and exploitation since they belong to the scheduled caste group. Therefore, it becomes necessary in providing them justice and helping them to lead a dignified life which could be possible by providing them with Citizenship and their rights.

**Keywords:** Citizenship, illegal migrants, security, Matua community, justice

## 1. Introduction

The term citizenship emerged in the Ancient Greece time period during which citizens possessing legal rights provided them the opportunity to engage in affairs of the state. In primitive times, however, everyone was not entitled to being a citizen: slaves, women, peasants were mere subjects who were denied citizenship. The term citizenship has four layers to it:- political, social, economic and cultural.

The political dimension of citizenship provides political rights for individuals which gives them the opportunity to actively engage in the politics of their country such as exercising the right to vote.

The social dimension of citizenship provides for such rights which ensures economic well-being, to live a dignified life with respect to the standards that prevails in the society.

The economic dimension of citizenship focuses on sustainable livelihoods, reducing poverty and ensuring economic-social well-being.

The cultural dimension of citizenship focuses on ethnocultural minorities to recognize their culture and to be represented in the mainstream society in an appropriate manner.

The term citizenship implies a lawful relationship between the state and individual to which it owes allegiance and is subjected to protection. Citizenship is a foundation of any nation. It ensures social cohesion, political participation and economic stability which enables the people to contribute and benefit from society. Citizenship is essential for constructing prosperous, resilient and inclusive communities, wherein the individuals are made capable to realize their potential. It holds profound significance without which one would not be able to enjoy the primary rights such as education or other welfare benefits. A citizen of a country enjoys certain legal benefits which vary from country to country, some of the benefits include- right to vote, right to hold public office, right to public education, right to residence, right to employment and many others. Citizenship also increases the active involvement of citizens in the process of democratic society which is beneficial for the development of the nation. It helps in fostering a national sense of identity, patriotism and attachment to one's country along with social cohesiveness and togetherness by ensuring a sense of belonging of people to a wider group. Citizenship also holds great significance in reduction of inequalities by fostering social mobility and achieving social and economic inclusion.

## 2. Research Objectives

1. To examine the constitutional framework and underlying principles of citizenship in India.
2. To analyze the historical impact of colonial rule and the Partition of India on the evolution of Indian citizenship laws and policies.
3. To study the socio-political and economic marginalization of the Matua community in the border districts of West Bengal.
4. To examine the citizenship claims of the Matua community in the context of caste-based exclusion and statelessness.
5. To evaluate the role of citizenship recognition in ensuring social justice, dignity, and constitutional rights for marginalized communities in India.

## 3. Methodology

The methodology adopted is qualitative in nature based on the secondary sources of data. The research involves systematic analysis of constitutional provisions, citizenship related legislations to examine the constitutional and legal framework. It also involves critically reviewing books, peer-reviewed journals, government reports in order to understand the historical and socio-political dimensions of citizenship and illegal migration in India. A case study approach is employed to analyze the citizenship claims of the Matua community in West Bengal focusing on the issues of marginalization and statelessness.

#### 4. Citizenship in Context of Indian Constitution

In every sovereign state, an individual who is recognized by the law as a legalized member is given the status of citizenship. According to the Indian constitution, an Indian citizen enjoys rights and privileges as compared to an alien or non-citizen.

The Indian constitution contains various articles which mentions how an individual can become an Indian citizen: -

Article 5<sup>1</sup> mentions that there are certain conditions which needs to be fulfilled: -

- A person should be born in territory of India
- If either of the parents are born in Indian territory
- A person should be staying for at least 5 years in territory of India

Article 6<sup>2</sup> mentions following conditions under which a person would be entitled to right of citizenship:

- If an individual's parents or grandparents were born in India according to Government of India Act,1935
- If an individual has migrated before 19th July 1948, and has been a resident of India since migration, or, if an individual has migrated after 19th July 1948, and has been registered as citizen of India by an officer appointed by the government of Dominion of India on an application made by him; provided that no individual shall be registered unless the person has been resident of India atleast for 6 months immediately preceding the date of application.

Article 7<sup>3</sup> mentions an individual who migrated to Pakistan from India after March 1, 1947 but returned later to India for resettlement in order to become an Indian citizen. However, in order to be a resident of India the individual needs to be a resident of India for six months preceding the date of application for registration.

Article 8<sup>4</sup> mentions an overseas individual who wants to acquire Indian citizenship can do so provided his parents or grandparents were born in undivided India but us residing outside India would become an Indian citizen if he has been registered as citizen of India by the diplomatic or consular representative of India in the country where he has been residing, either before or after commencement of the constitution.

Article 9<sup>5</sup> mentions that no individual would be a citizen of India or deemed to be citizen of India, if that individual has acquired the Citizenship of foreign country voluntarily.

Article 10<sup>6</sup> mentions that any individual who is the citizen of India or deemed to be citizen of India shall continue to be so subject to any provisions of law made by the Parliament of India.

<sup>1</sup> Laxmikant, M. (2023). *Indian Polity*. McGraw Publication. India

<sup>2</sup> Ibid

<sup>3</sup> Ibid

<sup>4</sup> Laxmikant, M. (2023). *Indian Polity*. McGraw Publication. India

<sup>5</sup> Ibid

<sup>6</sup> Ibid

Article 11<sup>7</sup> mentions that Parliament has been given the authority to make any provisions with regard to the acquisition and termination of citizenship or any matter related to it.

### Benefits of Indian citizenship

Indian citizenship provides recognition of being a member of Indian polity and allows the individual to enjoy benefits and privileges. These privileges are only entitled to Indian citizens and not to those who do not possess Indian citizenship. Some of the benefits are:-

1. Right to vote in General and Assembly elections.
2. Right to contest elections for MP, MLA, President and Vice-president.
3. Right to get appointed as a judge of the Supreme Court and High Court.
4. Right to employment in public offices.
5. Prohibition of discrimination on grounds of religion, caste, sex, race or place of birth.
6. Right to freedom of speech and expression.
7. Right to form associations.
8. Right to assemble peacefully without arms.
9. Right to freely move throughout the territory of India.
10. Right to settle and reside in any part of the territory of India.
11. Right to protection of language, script and culture of the minorities.
12. Right of minorities to establish and administer educational institutions.

### The issue of illegal migrants

Illegal migrants are those individuals who have arrived India without any legal documents or who had valid documents initially but have overstayed beyond a permitted time according to the Citizenship Act. India since independence has been facing the problem of illegal migration, consisting of people who have faced political, religious, social, economic and cultural repression and as a result have moved to India. Thus, making the idea of immigration a grave cause of concern for the security of the country.

Illegal migration is considered to be a serious issue since it is considered to be a serious threat to internal and external security of India. This illegal migration also leads to the probable chances of political instability especially when political leaders use this as a medium of gaining political power. This also disturbs law and order of the country because of the illegal and anti-national activities undertaken by the illegal migrants. It has also increased the problem of Human trafficking across the borders which has become a serious concern for the government.

However, the major focus is on the problem of illegal migration especially in the state of West Bengal. The illegal migration has been a grave cause of concern since 1971, when Bangladesh was created as a separate country. In the past few decades, this illegal migration from Bangladesh to West Bengal has been going on unabated. There has been a huge influx of people in west bengal belonging to the majority section of Bangladesh which has brought about internal demographic changes in the state as well as districts which has affected Indo-Bangladesh relations. The major cause of migration of people to West Bengal from Bangladesh has been because of various political and economic factors like economic stagnation, religious persecution, social insecurity, demographic pressures.

<sup>7</sup> Ibid

Since partition millions of people from East Pakistan had taken shelter in various bordering districts of West Bengal. The migrants from East Pakistan were considered legal till the Bangladesh Freedom Struggle 1971 after which this migration was stopped.

It is being observed that these illegal migrants have been able to arrange voter card and even Aadhar card for proof. They have been purchasing land, availing benefits from government services. However, what needs to be noticed and brought to the forefront is that there are few minority migrants who are associated with terrorism and illegal trafficking, which poses a serious threat to the security of the state and nation. In recent years, Bangladeshi migrants have entered Kolkata in large numbers as well. Some of them have been taken into custody as well for not having valid documents. There have been criminal cases registered against them in Bangladesh as a result of which they have been taking shelter in Kolkata and nearby areas. With every passing year the situation is getting worse.

In recent times, we are witnessing an ethno-communal dimension to the security question with regard to illegal migrants from Bangladesh coming to India. The villages which are situated at the border of India and Bangladesh are mainly Muslim majority villages and there has also been threat of Inter-Services Intelligence operations in these areas. The security of the state is at stake because through different land borders and water-ways Bangladeshi terrorists are trying to West Bengal.

Apart from security issues there are several other factors that affect the state with illegal migration. One of it being socio-economic impact in the form that these migrants try to have a control on the land that belongs to the local. They also get access to government subsidy programmes such as ration items, education and health care benefits from government schools and clinics. Due to the influx of large migrants, they have displaced native workers and have taken up the jobs for lower wages which has increased the conflict. It is also having a political impact as well. It is being observed that the Bangladeshi immigrants who are settling down in the bordering districts of West Bengal are playing a decisive role in ensuring the political outcome of the election polls. This is resulting in a perception that the political power is being taken away from the locals by the migrants.

Let us take an in depth understanding of influx Bangladeshi migrants in various districts of West Bengal

## NORTH 24 PARGANAS

This district witnesses the largest migration from Bangladesh. It shares a border with Bangladesh. The two subdivisions Bangon and Bashirhat are considered to be a significant entry point for migrants.<sup>8</sup> The migrants who came from Bangladesh after 1971 were mostly Hindus. They got involved in various professions after settling down here. The migrants from Bangladesh are considered to be important determinants of elections. The political parties provide protection to these migrants since they are considered to be potential vote banks. It was for this reason that they have facilitated the stay of these illegal migrants by providing them with fake Voter Identity Cards and Ration Cards which are essential for them to be declared as Indian citizens.

<sup>8</sup> Nandy, Debasish. (2019). *Socio-Political and Security perspectives of illegal Bangladeshi migrants in West Bengal: the impact on Indo-Bangladesh relations*. Journal of Historical Archaeology and Anthropological sciences. Vol 4. No 3. Pg 124

## NADIA

It is another concentrated district of Bangladeshi migrants. The Bangladeshi migrants mostly have taken entry from the Gede border. The people from various districts of Bangladesh such as Rajsahi, Kustia, Pabna had entered through the border in 1947 and also during the liberation movement in 1971.<sup>9</sup> The Cooper's Camp is the biggest refugee camp in the district of Nadia. It is one of the oldest and least known refugee camp in the South Asian region. People from this area are considered to be a small vote bank for political parties and have profound influence in elections.

## MURSHIDABAD

This district is considered to be one of the most controversial districts of West Bengal. It is a highly Muslim majority district. The Lalgola area of this district is known for illegal entry of Bangladeshi migrants. However the influx of migrants is less compared to other districts. The people are mostly illiterate and they are engaged in agriculture, silk handloom and bird binding work.

## COOCH BEHAR

It shares a common border with Bangladesh and Bhutan. The people mostly belong to Scheduled Caste, Scheduled Tribe and mostly migrants from Bangladesh and Bhutan.

## The Politicization of Matua Community

Matua is an anti-Brahmanical sect that emerged in the 1870s in Eastern Bengal among the lower caste Namasudras.<sup>10</sup> The sect was founded by Harichand Thakur and later organized and consolidated by his son Guruchand Thakur. This community remained aloof from the nationalist movement since it was perceived as largely Brahmin endeavor. They were more inclined to treat Matua faith as a separate religion. With the partition and formation of Bangladesh, the Matuas entered the state of West Bengal who constitute the second largest Scheduled Caste population of West Bengal. They are mostly concentrated in the North and South 24 parganas, along with it they also have their presence in other border districts such as Nadia, Howrah, Cooch Behar and Malda.<sup>11</sup>

Even though the migration continued even after 1971, the legal qualifications for citizenship and the policy of rehabilitation became more stringent. The East Bengalis belonging to the upper caste had faced no trouble with citizenship because of early migration. They had settled in Calcutta and its suburbs, with the government not paying much heed to it. Since the Namasudras migrated later, they faced difficulty in acquiring citizenship. Most of them had to resettle outside West Bengal because of limited availability of land and resources in the state. During the period between April 1958 and December 1963, people who had migrated were denied all relief and assistance by the government. But those who migrated from January 1964 till March 1971 were permitted for rehabilitation only on the condition that they were to settle outside the state of West Bengal.<sup>12</sup>

<sup>9</sup> Ibid, 125

<sup>10</sup> Nandy, Debashish. (2019). *Socio-Political and Security perspectives of illegal Bangladeshi migrants in West Bengal: the impact on Indo-Bangladesh relations*. Journal of Historical Archaeology and Anthropological sciences. Vol 4. No 3. Pg 124

<sup>11</sup> Ibid

<sup>12</sup> <https://www.indiatoday.in/opinion/story/partition-caste-and-citizenship-the-matu>

In the wake of the Bangladesh Liberation War, there was a massive refugee crisis in 1970-71, after which the government of India in November 1971 decided that they would not grant citizenship to people who had crossed over from East Bengal starting March 25, 1971. This resulted in declaring the migrants as permanent refugees and were considered not eligible for citizenship. But in due course of time, these refugees managed to acquire government documents like PAN, Voter Card, Aadhar Card which helped them to become de facto citizens.

The Citizenship Amendment Act 2003, declared that those migrants that did not possess valid travel documents like passports and visas were to be regarded as illegal migrants. The Namasudra refugees since then have been suspected as illegal infiltrators during the registration of electoral rolls. Thus, it is stated that in practice, these citizenship policies are more inclined towards favorable treatment of upper castes. In the pre-independence era, the Namasudras in undivided Bengal were regarded as 'Chandalas'. The Chandalas did not belong to the traditional four-fold Varna system which is considered to be an integral part of Hindu society. They were eminent dalit communities of Bengal. The Namasudras were prevented from visiting the Hindu temples and the Brahmin priests were not allowed to conduct their religious rituals. Since there was suppression of people belonging to this community, the Matuas held uplifting meetings to foster stronger togetherness. The initiation of Namasudra movement was from the Duttadanga meeting in 1881 in Faridpur which was the starting point of Matua Reformatory Religious Movement. It was led by the Matua Religious leaders and is in reality inseparable from the Matua Religious Reformatory Movement.<sup>13</sup>

The growth and origin of the Matua Religious Movement was East Bengal centric. There has been no mention of this religious movement in contemporary mainstream history and literature. However Bengali literature has ample examples of religious texts, from 'Charyapad' to 'Mangal Kabya' and 'ShreeKrishnakirtan', the 19th century Bengali literature being modern in nature refused to accept religious scriptures as exemplary literary texts. Still, as being the very first example of Dalit Movement in Bengal the religious scriptures of Matuas, the 'Shree Shree Harililamrita' and 'Shree Shree Guruchandcharit' held immense importance in historical value of its origin as a text.<sup>14</sup>

Though the right to freedom and equality of law has been provided to people in the post independent India but has not been translated into action. This is one of the major reasons for the backwardness of certain sections of people in society and also resulted in division of castes and class. Thus it becomes essential in India to preach the idea of religion of humanity and fraternity. The Matua religion emerged due to the injustice and superstitions that prevailed in the society. The religion focused on the oppressed section of society and worked towards their upliftment and emancipation through education. This is why the Matua religion was widely accepted and acknowledged.

The Matua community has been facing injustice and exploitation politically, economically and socially. The community has been denied basic rights that allow an individual to lead a dignified life. This community has been part of India since pre-independence time period but due to partition the Matua

<sup>13</sup> Pal, Krishnendu. (2021). *The Reformation of the Matua movement as a stepping stone for the upliftment of the Dalits in Bengal: A Study*. Turkish Online Journal of Qualitative Enquiry. Vol 12. No 6. Pg 8792

<sup>14</sup> Ibid, 8793

community got displaced and some of them had to leave their ancestral home and shift to a new land. However the community had been facing persecution in Bangladesh since they were a minority community. The Matua returned to India but faced difficulty in receiving the citizenship. They had to stay as refugees who were deprived of basic rights and resources. They faced discrimination and exploitation from the society since they belonged to the scheduled caste group. The Matuas were deprived of education, health benefits and even employment were given to them at the lower levels. Therefore the Matua community demands justice and are entitled to the right to a dignified life.

It is because of this the Matua community is being politicized and used by political parties for their benefits but none are actually taking steps in providing citizenship to this community. They are considered an essential vote bank for the political parties. During the 1960s, the Communists raised the cause of the refugees by attacking the Congress for ignoring them which resulted in making the Communists playing a pivotal role in the state. TMC, in 2009, approached the Matua Mahasangha-an organization consisting of Bangladeshi immigrants, and had used their votes to come to power. The Bharatiya Janata Party is now wanting to bring in forefront the Hindu immigrant cause in the hope that it could replicate the success the other two parties achieved. The Citizenship Amendment Act(CAA) passed in 2019 is a medium of appeal to the Matua community by the BJP.

## 5. Importance of CAA for Matua Community

The Citizenship Act of 1955, was approved and ratified which helped the individuals in attaining the citizenship of India. In 2019, Government of India proposed to bring in the Citizenship Amendment Bill which would initiate certain amendments in the Citizenship Act 1955 which would include making certain groups of illegal migrants eligible for applying for Indian citizenship.

The Citizenship Act 1955, provides for individuals who can acquire Indian citizenship and also on what grounds. An individual can become an Indian citizen by birth or their parents are of Indian origin or have resided in the country for a certain time period. Illegal migrants are prevented from acquiring Indian citizenship. A bill was presented in 2016 in Lok Sabha to amend the Citizenship Act of 1955 which sought to provide citizenship to illegal migrants belonging to these religions:- Hindus, Sikhs, Buddhists, Jains, Parsis and Christians from Bangladesh, Pakistan and Afghanistan. The Citizenship Amendment Bill was approved and ratified on December 11, 2019 and received the assent of the President on December 12, 2019.

The Citizenship Amendment Act had stirred a lot of protests and controversies regarding its implementation. Governments of various states protested against its implementation since according to them this Act creates a division on the basis of religion. According to India's citizenship law, before the implementation of Citizenship Amendment Act, religion was not a determinant for an individual's eligibility for an Indian passport. Naturalization was a medium through which individuals were granted citizenship but they had to wait for 11 years in order to be eligible for Indian citizenship. However this got altered by the Citizenship Amendment Act, which brought into the perspective of religion in citizenship. The Muslim victims of religious persecution in Pakistan (like the Ahmadiyya), Afghanistan (the Hazara) or other neighboring nations (such as the Rohingya in Myanmar), will still need to wait for 11 years before they become eligible for Indian citizenship and unlike Hindus, Parsis, Sikhs, Buddhists,

Jains and Christians, they need valid documentation to justify their presence in India.<sup>15</sup> This clearly violates the Article 14 of the Indian constitution which clearly mentions that the state would ensure that every person is equal before law and is also entitled to equal protection of law.

Even in northeastern states, citizenship is being granted to massive individuals who are considered to be illegal Bangladeshi migrants which has become a great cause of concern since it is leading to changes in demography along with there has also been decline in indigenous culture. It is also stated that this Act violates the Assam Accord which was signed by Rajiv Gandhi and All Assam Students' Union. According to the accord those who moved into Assam after 24th March, 1971 had to be expatriated irrespective of their religion. This is the reason why the Act was not accepted by the people of Assam because they wanted the illegal migrants to be regarded as illegal with religion having no role to play. Apart from this there has also been an economic problem as a pertinent issue mainly because of the large number of migrants the pressure on land would increase and there would also be the problem of job scarcity.

Apart from these criticisms, there have been arguments in favor of the Act as well. The naturalization can be a medium through which the Ahmadiyyas and Rohingyas can apply for citizenship of India provided they have their valid documents. Therefore, the Act does not prevent or refrain Muslims from applying for Indian citizenship even though they belong to Pakistan, Bangladesh and Afghanistan. Moreover it also gives preference to these 3 countries mainly because they had civilizational ties with India and because of the partition, it has created a situation in which the Hindus and other minority population has been dwindling.

This Citizenship Amendment Act holds profound importance for the Matua community in West Bengal which fulfilled their long-standing demand for citizenship and recognition in India. The community has been long advocating for the proper rehabilitation and resettlement of Hindu migrants from Bangladesh. The Act however, sparked controversies within the Matua community with respect to fear and confusion of the execution of the Citizenship Amendment Act. In order to obtain citizenship, according to the Act, the applicants require one document atleast that is listed under Schedule 1A of the Citizenship Amendment Act rules to prove their nationality of either Bangladesh, Pakistan or Afghanistan. The documents would include education or birth certificates, passports, land or tenancy records. However, the problem lies that most people in the border districts of Bengal do not possess necessary documents to prove their residency in any of the countries mentioned above.

Though citizenship has been an important demand for the Matua community which would help in providing them a dignified life in the society but apart from this they also demand equality, justice and employment for people of their community. The Matuas have been facing social exclusion and are also deprived of social benefits. Since they belong to lower caste groups, they are prevented from entering temples, are allotted low rank jobs and are treated as someone who is not part of society. The upper castes treat the Matuas as not part of society. The living conditions of them were shameful and downtrodden. Economically the wages they earned were minimal which was not sufficient for them to survive.

The Matuas, just like other communities, are an essential part of society and should be treated in similar manner as the other communities.

<sup>15</sup> <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2024/3/12/why-is-indias-citizenship-amendment-act-so-controversial>

## 6. Conclusion

Indian society is divided amongst various castes and classes which leads to social exclusion of certain groups of people who belong to lower sections of society. The Matuas have been such a community in West Bengal who have faced such exclusion and injustice politically, economically and socially. This community has also been deprived of citizenship as well since they are considered as refugees and illegal migrants from Bangladesh. This makes it very essential to grant them citizenship and benefits that each individual enjoys as a citizen of India. They need to have the same social status as the other majority sections of society.

## References:

1. Austin, G. (1966). *The Indian Constitution: Cornerstone of a Nation*. Oxford University Press.
2. Basu, D. D. (2022). *Introduction to the Constitution of India* (26th ed.). LexisNexis.
3. Chakrabarti, P. (2017). Citizenship, migration and the politics of identity in India. *Journal of South Asian Studies*, 40(3), 567–583.
4. Ghosh, A. (2019). The politics of citizenship and exclusion in India: Borderland communities and the question of belonging. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 54(49), 45–53.
5. Jayal, N. G. (2013). *Citizenship and Its Discontents: An Indian History*. Harvard University Press.
6. Kumar, A. (2018). Illegal migration and internal security in India. *Strategic Analysis*, 42(4), 345–358.
7. Laxmikant, M. (2023). *Indian Polity*. McGraw Publication. India
8. Ministry of Home Affairs. (2016). *Annual Report on Illegal Migration and Border Management*. Government of India.
9. Nandy, Debasish. (2019). Socio-Political and Security perspectives of illegal Bangladeshi migrants in West Bengal: the impact on Indo-Bangladesh relations. *Journal of Historical Archaeology and Anthropological sciences*, 4(3), 124-130
10. Pal, Krishnendu. (2021). The Reformation of the Matua movement as a stepping stone for the upliftment of the Dalits in Bengal: A Study. *Turkish Online Journal of Qualitative Enquiry*, 12(6), 8792-8800
11. Rudolph, L. I., & Rudolph, S. H. (1987). *In Pursuit of Lakshmi: The Political Economy of the Indian State*. University of Chicago Press
12. Talukdar, J. (2020). Marginalized identities and the struggle for citizenship: The case of the Matua community in West Bengal. *Social Change*, 50(3), 389–404.
13. <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2024/3/12/why-is-indias-citizenship-amendment-act-so-controversial>
14. <https://www.indiatoday.in/opinion/story/partition-caste-and-citizenship-the-matu>